



CLARK COUNTY WASHINGTON

clark.wa.gov

1300 Franklin Street
PO Box 5000
Vancouver, WA 98666-5000
564.397.2000

Clark County Climate Change Planning

Community Advisory Group Meeting #4

May 22, 2024, 5:30-8:30pm PT

Public Service Center in Vancouver, WA and
Zoom Webinar

Meeting Summary



The WA Department of Commerce climate planning grant is supported with funding from Washington's Climate Commitment Act. The CCA supports Washington's climate action efforts by putting cap-and-invest dollars to work reducing climate pollution, creating jobs, and improving public health. Information about the CCA is available at www.climate.wa.gov.

Attendees

Community Advisory Group members: Jessica Brown, Gabriela Mendoza Ewing, Ann Foster, Nelson Holmberg, Noelle Lovern, Brent Marsden, Nick Massie, Kathy Miu, Dave Rowe, Andrea Smith, Don Steinke, Justin Wood, Monica Zazueta

County staff: Harrison Husting, Jenna Kay

Consultant team: Sylvia Ciborowski, Nicole Metildi, María Verano (Kearns & West); Tracy Lunsford (Parametrix); Dana Hellman, Zach Kearnl (CAPA Strategies)

Number of members of the public in attendance: 2

Welcome

Clark County and Kearns & West staff welcomed everyone to the meeting. Sylvia Ciborowski, Kearns & West, reviewed the agenda and outlined the purpose and desired outcomes of the meeting:

- Share and discuss the next iteration of Resilience sub-element goals.
- Share and discuss policies to address initial Resilience goals.
- Give an update about the Environmental Justice Coalition’s (EJC) work and the Equity Lens.

Additionally, Sylvia reviewed meeting logistics and greeted members of the public, noting that there would be a public comment opportunity at the end of the meeting.

Approval of Meeting Summary

Sylvia asked the members if they had any red flags or comments about the Community Advisory Group (CAG) Meeting #3 Summary.

In addition to comments about the Meeting #3 Summary, members also shared comments about the summary of CAG initial brainstorm of resilience goals, which was sent to the CAG in their materials packet in addition to the Meeting #3 Summary. Comments are summarized below:

- Meeting #3 Summary
 - One member shared that they felt the affordability and alternative energy sources were de-emphasized in the summary of the Resilience goals brainstorm, and that access to natural resources and minerals should be highlighted. Another member agreed that upfront costs and affordability should be kept in mind throughout this process.
- Summary of CAG initial brainstorm of resilience goals
 - One member explained that the phrase “rather than expanding the Urban Growth Boundary” in the “Plan for in-fill, dense development” goal for Zoning and Development would lead to increased housing cost. Two members agreed and suggested changing that language or taking out the phrase.
- A member noted that density in the urban boundary positively affects affordability.
- A member asked if this would be a matter of public record, which was confirmed by Sylvia Ciborowski, Kearns & West.

Sylvia thanked everyone for their comments and asked them to email additional edits to the project team.

Project Updates

Jenna Kay, Clark County, shared the following project updates and reminders:

- The meeting packets that were sent also included comments that were received from CAG members and members of the public since the last CAG meeting.
- Printed copies of House Bill 1181, the House Guidance, and the Menu of Measures were available for those attending the meeting in person and could be requested from Jenna by those attending virtually.
- The freight position in the CAG was recently vacated and applications are being accepted until June 6.
- There will be a work session with the County Council on June 5. An update on the project will be shared, which will be an opportunity to receive guidance on policy development from the Council.
- The county received many responses for its survey on severe weather. The surveys will be reviewed and summarized in the coming days. The results will be shared back with the CAG.
- The next opportunity for community engagement will be at a community workshop on June 22, 9-11am where community members can give feedback related to Resilience.
- The Comprehensive Plan has an open house on May 28, 29 and 30. The open house events are related to the Comprehensive Plan Environmental Impact Statement scoping.

CAG members had the following comments:

- One member shared that they thought the severe weather survey was worded in a negative tone, specifically around weather in the Pacific Northwest, and did not promote the positive reasons for why people live in the area. Another member agreed that Clark County is a great place to live.
- One member, who is also an EJC member, shared that they are hosting their first engagement event on Saturday, May 25, with more dates to come. They shared that the activities would include a healing circle, information about donut economics, an art activity, opportunities to fill out the survey for a raffle entry, free food, and dancing.
- A member asked if everyone could share their upcoming events. Sylvia responded that EJC members who are hosting events to gather comments on the Climate Element are invited to share their events.
- One member asked when the next CAG meeting would be. Sylvia responded that it would be on June 26, 2024, and that they would receive a follow-up email with more information.

EJC and Equity Lens Update

Jenna shared the following update about the EJC and Equity Lens:

- The 15 EJC member organizations are planning engagement events, several of which are occurring in May. The goal of these events is focused on collecting feedback on resilience, using the same or similar questions as are in the severe weather survey. A summary of the feedback received at the events will be shared with CAG members.

- The Equity Lens is currently being developed by the EJC. As stated in Washington State legislation, HB 1181, the Climate Element must advance environmental justice and avoid creating or worsening localized climate impacts to vulnerable populations and overburdened communities.
- The Greenhouse Gas (GHG) sub-element states that goals and policies must prioritize greenhouse gas reductions that benefit overburdened communities in order to maximize the cobenefits of reduced air pollution and environmental justice.
- The Resilience sub-element states that goals and policies must identify, protect, and enhance community resiliency to climate change impacts, including social, economic, and built environment factors that support adaptation to climate impacts consistent with environmental justice.
- Jenna shared definitions in the legislation for environmental justice, overburdened communities, and vulnerable populations.
- There are two key tools to help the CAG and project team address environmental justice in the process. 1) The EJC helps the county reach overburdened communities and vulnerable populations, and people in the community who may not otherwise participate. 2) The Equity Lens will help the CAG, EJC, and project team evaluate policy ideas which are being worked on to ensure they consider burdens and benefits to overburdened communities and vulnerable populations.
- Example key questions for the Equity Lens were shared with the group.

CAG members had the following comments:

- One member would like community members exposed to polluted air to be included in the definition of vulnerable populations.
- One member shared that they were glad to see that the focus of this group was shifting from the tactical level to the policy level.

Resilience Goals Update

Sylvia shared with the group that over 200 comments on Resilience goals, from both the EJC and CAG were reviewed by the project team and then distilled to create draft Resilience goals and accompanying policies. To explain this further, Sylvia introduced Dana Hellman, CAPA Strategies.

Dana shared a high-level summary of themes heard from the CAG and EJC for the 11 different sectors, which include:

- Agriculture and food systems
- Buildings and energy
- Cultural resources and practices
- Economic development
- Ecosystems
- Emergency management
- Health and wellbeing
- Transportation
- Waste management
- Water management
- Zoning and development

Dana then shared the draft Resilience goal and policy list that was developed from the 240 CAG and EJC comments, summarized below.

- After the last CAG meeting, a high-level summary of the CAG’s brainstorm was shared with the EJC. The EJC expanded upon the goals brainstormed by the CAG. From there, the CAPA Strategies team matched the goals and comments provided by the CAG and the EJC to existing goals and policies across several plans (e.g., Clark County Comprehensive Plan, Clark Regional Natural Hazard Mitigation Plan, etc.).
- After this meeting and gathering additional feedback from the CAG, CAPA will edit the goals and policies and send them to the EJC for review.
- There is a rough target of no more than 35 resilience policies. Having many more policies means there would not be resources to do a very thorough evaluation of all of the policies.
- Jenna discussed how the goals and policies created through this process are different than a Climate Action Plan because they will become a part of a Comprehensive Plan. Policies in a Comprehensive Plan guide future land use actions and do not typically include implementation (or ‘tactical’) level language or details. Therefore, policies are usually written in broad, general terms.
- Comprehensive Plan policies are implemented through zoning and development regulations, programs, and capital projects.
- The project team has created a draft comment tracker, which shows how all CAG and EJC comments were considered and reviewed to create the draft goals and policy list. The team will share this tracker with the CAG after the meeting.

CAG members had the following questions and suggestions:

- Question: Is there a way to measure the policies to see if the goals are met?
 - *Answer: Jenna responded that there is a requirement for monitoring progress that will need to be discussed and developed in the future.*
- One member suggested defining “goals” and “policy,” stating that it would be helpful to disassociate goals from policies and to better define the goals.
- Question: Will we revisit the (State Environmental Policy Act) SEPA process in the future?
 - *Answer: Jenna responded that the work being reviewed right now will be considered in the SEPA process which will not occur until later in the year.*

Zach Kearn, CAPA Strategies, clarified that they took the 240+ comments received in the last month to create 28 goals and 42 policies. The policies are a way to implement the goals. Additionally, it was explained that the Department of Commerce provides a Menu of Measures with example policies that could be included in the Climate Element. Zach shared an example of how they matched a goal to existing policies, and how CAG and EJC feedback influenced the draft proposed policy to match the goal.

Resilience Goals and Policies Analysis

Sylvia reconvened the group after a short break. She shared a comment in the chat from a member, who asked that the group read their Vision Statement at each meeting to remind members of their shared vision. The member also posed the question of, “How are we going to hold ourselves accountable to our vision statement when we are creating goals and policies?”

Sylvia noted that the CAG could review the Vision Statement at the beginning of the group's next meeting.

Sylvia then shared the next topic: Discussing the 11 sector draft Resilience goals and policies. Sylvia explained that the team would like to hear the members' thoughts on the goals to see if they believed the goals would help build resilience to impacts of climate change in each sector. Comments from the Zoom chat are captured in the below discussion summaries. See [Appendix A](#) to review the chat history.

Dana shared the Agriculture and Food System draft goals and policies. Sylvia facilitated a discussion about them. Members shared the following questions and comments:

- A member requested that the policy about supporting conservation include “indirect or direct” in the financial support section.
- One member asked that a policy for green space in high density urban environments to grow food be included.
- One member wanted to add “access to water” under the third proposed policy.
- A member shared concerns about the process, stating that they did not think that their feedback from the last meeting was adequately incorporated into the draft list of Resilience goals and policies. They added that they did not see a connection between the brainstorm activity that CAG members participated in at the last meeting and the draft policy list. The member stated that the process would be more favorable if they could see how these goals included CAG feedback but since that was not provided, it would be difficult to participate in the day's discussion. Staff clarified that the initial goal and policy list was created from the over 200 comments received from the CAG and EJC. Staff noted that the goals and policies list is meant to incorporate CAG and EJC feedback, but does not use their exact words, and noted that the team would send out a comment tracker after the meeting to help show how member comments influences and were incorporated into the draft goal and policy list.
- One member shared that they appreciated that the team had consolidated the goals from the feedback received. They also added that they were happy to see that the phrase “food access” would be included in the final version because it would be the first time to include this in the Comprehensive Plan. They added that they would like for there to be more emphasis on the phrase “direct assistance.”
- One member asked to include the disuse of pesticides in the goals.
- A member recommended that encouraging more people to pursue agriculture jobs should be included.
- A member asked that creating a farm hub for community members to learn about farming be included. Another member wondered if many people are looking for agricultural jobs now and into the future.

Dana shared the Buildings and Energy consolidated draft goals and policies. Sylvia facilitated a discussion about them. Members shared the following questions and comments:

- One member recommended adding language about congregate heating and cooling areas.
- A member asked that access to mineral resources be included in the language, particularly resources to create batteries, solar panels, and wind turbines.
- A member asked how Clark Public Utilities is involved.

- Jenna shared that Clark Public Utilities is involved in the Partner Agencies Team and will provide their feedback on the Climate Element goals and policies.
- One member suggested adding “distributed energy resources and resource management systems” to the goal language.
- A member noted that they would like underground electricity lines to be included in the goals. They suggested adding hydrogen fuel cells, which use fewer mineral resources.
- One member expressed concern about batteries as a fuel source. They suggested that more time be spent looking at alternative resources like sodium ion batteries, and self-sustaining airing and cooling systems. They emphasized the importance of living within the means of Earth’s planetary boundaries.
- Another member expressed concern about the production of batteries for electronic vehicles, which are made with minerals mined from Congo with child labor.
- A member suggested looking at more alternatives for backup energy storage facilities and technology.

Dana shared the Cultural Resources and Practices consolidated draft goals and policies. Sylvia facilitated a discussion about them. Members shared the following questions and comments:

- A member shared that with climate change, it would be imperative to be more innovative when protecting traditional practices and resources.
- One member shared that they would like the phrase “salmon thriving” to be included in the policy. They emphasized the importance of considering historic sites, cultural resources, and practices of people native to the area.
- Another member asked for the language to include, “original inhabitants.” They stated that the original inhabitants have knowledge to share, and we should collaborate with them on this effort.
- A member asked why the third policy was directed at youth and climate effected communities. They requested that the language be broader to provide education to more communities. Another member agreed that policies should be inclusive of all types of people.

Dana shared the Economic Development consolidated draft goals and policies. Sylvia facilitated a discussion about them. Members shared the following questions and comments:

- One member shared their frustration with the process because they were not able to see these goals and formulate comments prior to this meeting. The member emphasized the importance of CAG members sending comments about the goals after the meeting to ensure the success of this process.
- A member shared that resilience should be defined as the amenities being available near where people live. If people do not have services or amenities near them, living there will not be viable. To that extent, they recommended changing the phrasing from “providing jobs close to housing” to “providing jobs and amenities close to existing housing, job sites and amenities.”
- A member shared that they would like pilot projects for thermal energy networks to be included in the circular economy section.
- One member requested to include a section on having the community plant and maintain trees and gardens.
- One member shared that they would like to redefine how businesses distribute wealth. Redefining how wealth is distributed could contribute to creating a community where everyone has a stake in the economy.

- A member asked to include “residential development” in the third policy to minimize car trips.

Dana shared the Ecosystems consolidated draft goals and policies. Sylvia facilitated a discussion about them. Members shared the following questions and comments:

- One member made a comment on the third proposed goal. The member expressed concern about the proposed I-5 bridge and said that it would make Vancouver into a heat island.
- A member suggested that these goals be directed at the general ecosystem, not just humans. They asked that wildlife and migration be included in the goal, and promotion of habitat connections.
- One member asked what the difference between priority habitat and critical areas was.
 - Jenna responded that these are terms that are coming out of state legislation. Priority habitats are one piece of critical areas. There are different types of what the state considers critical areas. There are geologic hazard areas, flood hazard areas, wetlands, critical aquifer recharge areas, and habitat conservation areas. Habitat conservation areas include priority habitat areas identified by the WA Department of Fish and Wildlife. Some of these priority habitat areas relate to the presence of a threatened or endangered species; some areas relate to a particular type of habitat such as riparian areas. *Staff note post meeting: more information about priority habitats is available here: <https://wdfw.wa.gov/species-habitats/at-risk/phs>*

Dana shared the Emergency Management consolidated draft goals and policies. Sylvia facilitated a discussion about them. Members shared the following questions and comments:

- One member stated that the policy for the “improve access to resiliency and mitigation information” goal looked less like a policy and more like a tactic. The member suggested that the policy could suggest establishing a broader education program rather than a webpage. A member shared that they lived in the urban-forest interface and, while they believed that it should be the responsibility of the resident to worry about themselves in case of a fire, wondered what the responsibility of the county would be to these residents.

Dana shared the Health and Well-Being consolidated draft goals and policies. Sylvia facilitated a discussion about them. Members shared the following questions and comments:

- One member shared that they liked to have spaces for people to congregate during or after weather events. They shared that using these moments to teach transferrable skills, like blanket making, would benefit the community and could be useful.
- A member stated that they would like to include an incentive for landlords to address properties with pest and rodent infestations. In addition, they would like enforcement and education to be included in the first policy.
- One member suggested evaluating the risk of using integrated pest-management methods and specifically stating in the policy if these methods include using pesticides or not. They also expressed concerns about using pesticides in pest management.
- A member shared that the air quality goal seems too vague.
- When one member thinks of resilience to climate change, they think of heat and smoke. To be resilient to these things, people need air conditioning and air purifiers. They shared

that the county's health department should be included in developing goals about Health and Well-Being.

- A member requested adding yoga or meditation circles or hubs to the goal. They also asked to include art with nature, education time, and having a comment box at the hub to share their climate resiliency ideas.

Dana shared the Transportation consolidated goals and policies. Sylvia facilitated a discussion about them. Members shared the following questions and comments:

- One member requested to add electric locomotives to the goals, sharing that diesel trains idle in Vancouver for hours, creating air pollution. They also requested electric overhead wires for an electric transportation system.
- A member suggested adding an electric scooter and bike share program.
- One member added that the city could also subsidize electric motors to transform regular bicycles into ebikes.
- Transit and better transit connectivity (between C-Tran, Trimet, and Amtrak) should be included.
- A member shared their excitement regarding the first policy's intent to expand or complete multimodal transportation pathways in the area.
- A member shared that they would like to see well-lit transit systems (buses and trains) and roadways for the safety of people bicycling.
- One member asked for better signage and information to be included on all public transit methods.

Dana shared the Waste Management consolidated goals and policies. Sylvia facilitated a discussion about them. Members shared the following questions and comments:

- One member recommended adding a surcharge to waste management to encourage people to recycle and properly dispose of waste. Another member expressed concern that adding a surcharge would result in people not using the appropriate channels to dispose of waste.
- One member asked that more thought be put into composting and how to make it easier and more accessible for users.
- A member shared that the producer of materials should be responsible for the end of life of the product.
- One member requested that a waste management and recycling education piece be established. They added that the program should include people who go into the community to inform them of how they have been disposing of their waste incorrectly.
- A member shared that 95% of the area's recycling goes into the correct facilities in the recycling bags.
- One member shared that having communal recycling spots, instead of each home having one, makes people less likely to recycle. They suggested making recycling bins mandatory for each residence.
- One member asked for more thought to be put into compostable eating utensils and plates.

Sylvia thanked the members for their comments on the goals. She shared that there were still two more sections to cover and that there was not enough time to discuss them. Sylvia asked the members to review those additional sections, as well as the goal and policy list in its entirety, and send their feedback via email to Jenna.

Public Comment

Sylvia opened the public comment period but did not receive any comments. She reminded the public that there is a form on Clark County's website to submit comments at any time during the project at <https://clark.wa.gov/community-planning/comp-plan-comments> and comments can be emailed to comp.plan@clark.wa.gov.

Next Steps

Sylvia reviewed next steps for CAG members, which consisted of:

- Send feedback on the draft Resilience goals and policy list to Jenna by May 29. *Staff post-meeting note: after the meeting, staff adjusted this due date to June 5.*
- A survey will be sent before the next CAG meeting to help the group have a productive and efficient conversation.
- Send comments and revisions to the CAG Meeting #3 Summary by email to Jenna.

The next CAG meeting will be on June 26. Sylvia encouraged members to come in-person to the June CAG meeting as it will be an important meeting about the draft Resilience goals and policies.

One member shared that “we must act as if we only answer to our ancestors, our children, and our unborn.”

Jenna thanked the members for attending the meeting and shared that they would strive to share materials as far in advance as possible. She shared that there will be additional opportunities to review the draft Resilience goals and policies before the next meeting and to please email her with any additional feedback. Lastly, she shared that the list of goals can change and that it was a starting point to talk from.

Adjourn

The meeting adjourned at 8:30pm PT.

Appendix A: Zoom Chat

Below is a verbatim, unedited transcript of the Zoom webinar chat.

17:35:27 From Maria Verano, Kearns & West, she/her to Everyone:

For Zoom technical issues, email mverano@kearnswest.com

17:38:26 From Maria Verano, Kearns & West, she/her to Everyone:

Email comments to comp.plan@clark.wa.gov or submit a comment online:
<https://clark.wa.gov/community-planning/comp-plan-comments>

17:56:28 From Monica Zazueta to Everyone:

Thank you Ann 🙏🌻

18:36:56 From Maria Verano, Kearns & West, she/her to Everyone:

Break time. Please return by 6:45

18:37:44 From Maria Verano, Kearns & West, she/her to Everyone:

Resilience Goals and Policy List: <https://clark.wa.gov/media/document/173911>

18:44:32 From Monica Zazueta to Everyone:

May we read our vision statement each time we meet to remind ourselves of our shared vision please?

How are we going to hold ourselves accountable to our vision statement when we are creating goals and policies?

18:51:46 From Maria Verano, Kearns & West, she/her to Everyone:

Resilience Goals and Policy List: <https://clark.wa.gov/media/document/173911>

19:11:59 From Monica Zazueta to Everyone:

Creating a farm hub for community members to come and learn about farming. Paid work.

19:17:23 From Andrea Smith, CAG to Hosts and panelists:

Unfortunately EV batteries are made with minerals mined from Congo with child labor 😞

19:25:56 From Gabriela Ewing to Hosts and panelists:

Yes! Thank you Don Steinke ❤️

19:51:44 From Kathy Miu, CAG (she/her) to Hosts and panelists:

Thanks, Dana.

19:58:01 From Monica Zazueta to Everyone:

adding yoga, or meditation circles to the hubs, also creating art with nature, education time, having a comment box at the hub to ask the community about their climate resiliency ideas

20:00:53 From Monica Zazueta to Everyone:

With health and well being and economic development, build AC's & humidifiers here locally

20:07:32 From Monica Zazueta to Everyone:

Thank you Noelle for your comment. Well lit transit systems both buses, trains and roadways/bike ways for safety.

20:16:29 From Monica Zazueta to Everyone:

Clarification, I wasn't talking about using police in the water management aspect. Create jobs for people to do that at Waste Management. Thank you :)

20:17:32 From Monica Zazueta to Everyone:

Create jobs for people to go to the apartment complexes to teach them too 😊👏

20:21:29 From Maria Verano, Kearns & West, she/her to Everyone:

Email comments to comp.plan@clark.wa.gov or submit a comment online:
<https://clark.wa.gov/community-planning/comp-plan-comments>

CAG webpage: <https://clark.wa.gov/community-planning/community-advisory-group>

Project webpage: clark.wa.gov/community-planning/climate-change-planning

Project contact: Jenna Kay, jenna.kay@clark.wa.gov